CLIENTELISM AS FEMALE VOTING DETERMINANT IN DISTRICT KARAK: A CASE STUDY OF 2018 GENERAL ELECTIONS

Rifat Nazir[*]

Abstract

The primary objective of this research is to investigate clientelism as a determinant of female voting behavior, specifically analyzing its impact on the 2018 General Elections in District Karak. To comprehend voting behavior, the study has linked this determinant with voting behavior theories, particularly the theory of Clientelism. Regarding the application of the theory, it is argued that the theory is applicable in the electoral politics of District Karak. The most prevalent determinant in District Karak is clientelism (55.05%) to some extent. This study relies on both published and unpublished data and seeks to answer two key questions: Is clientelism the determinant of female voting behavior in the 2018 General Election in NA-34 District Karak? And what are the impacts of female voting behavior on the 2018 General Elections in NA-34 District Karak? Primary and secondary data have been collected for this paper, utilizing a mixed-method approach that incorporates both quantitative and qualitative methods. The population under study comprises all registered female voters of District Karak. Through the Yamoni formula, data is gathered

[*]Lecturer Pakistan studies Malakand university women sub campus Betkhela

from 400 respondents, employing a stratified sampling technique to collect data from registered female voters in three Tehsils: Banda Daud Shah, Takht-e-Nasrati, and Karak. The study reveals that economic benefits and candidates with a strong economic background significantly influenced women's voting behavior in constituency 34. The Pakistan People Party garnered support through the Benazir Income Support Program, and while perceptions of Imran Khan as a celebrity raised expectations for progress, his unfulfilled promises resulted in voter disappointment.

Keywords: Women's Voting Patterns, voting behavior, Clientelism Impact, Electoral Determinants, 2018 General Elections, economic benefits.

Introduction

The theory of clientelism involves the distribution of selected patronage and advantages to specific individuals or groups in exchange for political support. Traditionally, this concept has been viewed negatively by most writers and scholars, often associated with pre-modern social contexts and indicative of cultural and economic backwardness in a society. Nevertheless, it is acknowledged that the dynamics of clientelism persist in advanced socio-economic contexts, as noted by scholars discussing 'pork-barrel' political exchange and 'special interest

politics' in contemporary America (Hopkin, 2014, p.2). This paper seeks to deconstruct the key characteristics of clientelism in democratic countries to understand the reasons behind its bad reputation. The theory also outlines the impact of liberal and populist democratic ideologies on clientelist practices, aiming not to excuse clientelism but to present a clearer statement of the challenge it poses to democracy.

A strategy of electoral mobilization involves politicians offering private benefits, such as the distribution of goods and money, to individuals during electoral campaigns, which is regarded as electoral clientelism. This approach aims to secure support at the polls (Munoz, 2014, p.79).

Despite being rich in natural resources such as natural gas, oil, and uranium, Karak remains an underprivileged district in KP. Unfortunately, the local population has yet to experience the positive trickle-down effects of these resources, leading to economic deprivation. The longstanding impoverished economic plight of the people can be attributed to the negligence of political leaders in uplifting their constituency. In this context, Imran Khan emerged as a ray of hope for the local population. With the advent of the Imran government, people hoped for economic prosperity through developmental projects that would elevate their living standards, contributing to significant support for PTI.

Concerning the application of the Theory of Clientelism, it is argued that this theory is applicable in the electoral politics of District Karak. Employment opportunities and developmental aspects of clientelism have garnered strong support in elections, as empirical data substantiate the claim that clientelism is indeed applicable in the electoral politics of District Karak.

The main objectives of this paper are to investigate clientelism as a determinant of female voting behavior in the 2018 General Elections in NA-34 District Karak and to explore the impact of female voting behavior on the same elections. The paper aims to probe whether clientelism is the determinant of female voting behavior in the 2018 General Election in NA-34 District Karak and to analyze the impacts of female voting behavior on the electoral outcomes.

Literature Review

Khan and Ahmad (2017) conducted a quantitative analysis on clientelism as a voting determinant in NA-11 during the 2013 General Elections. Utilizing a questionnaire for data collection, the study revealed that the theory of clientelism is applicable to a limited extent, accounting for only (24.98%) in the electoral politics of District Mardan. Additionally, the authors discussed the opinion of a British conservative party politician, asserting that clientelism involves a collection of policies based on the

principle of "take there, give here." Despite economic and social differences, both the client and candidate benefit from mutually supporting each other at various levels of political, social, and administrative spheres. Clientelism is associated with the use of public resources within an electoral perspective, where candidates seek votes from clients and, in return, offer jobs and other welfare, fostering a beneficial process for candidates to secure high ballots and political support. However, this research study lacks information about female voting behavior.

Saud (2020) examined the impact of social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube on the youth of Pakistan during the 2018 General Election, focusing on various universities in the Federal Capital Islamabad. The author highlighted that traditional sources for information and communication have been replaced by social media, transforming the world into a global village and influencing the attitudes and behaviors of the younger generation. While the research delves into the impact of social media, it is limited to Islamabad and does not provide information about female voting behavior, particularly with regard to clientelism as a factor in voting behavior.

Wilder's (1996) work centers on elections in Pakistan, specifically in its most populous and politically powerful province, Punjab. The study focuses on the 1993 General

Election, offering comparisons with the elections of 1970, 1988, and 1990. Wilder argues that there is an imbalance of power between elected and non-elected institutions in Pakistan. The research also explores voting behavior and its political determinants, with a specific emphasis on rural and urban differences in Lahore, the largest city in Punjab. However, this study is comparative and confined to Lahore, lacking information about recent General Elections in 2018, clientelism, and female voting behavior.

Methodology

To ensure robust and reliable results, a mixed methods approach, encompassing both qualitative and quantitative research methods, was employed in this study. For primary data collection, a questionnaire was developed based on various political and social statements related to clientelism. Concurrently, qualitative data were gathered through interviews with female voters who participated in the 2018 General Election in NA-34 District Karak. The questionnaire and interview included inquiries about the respondents' opinions on voting criteria, such as giving votes based on developmental works in their village, supporting a candidate with a strong economic background, choosing a candidate committed to doing a lot for their family/village/constituency, engaging in vote bargaining, and

supporting a party that economically aids them (Benazir Income Support Program).

The research population, in terms of participation, encompassed all registered female voters belonging to NA-34 District Karak in the 2018 General Elections. In District Karak, the total number of women registered to cast their votes was 178,504. The female population in Tehsil Karak was 74,765, in Banda Daud Sha, it was 42,088, and in Takht-e-Nasrati, it was 61,651.

The sample size was determined using Taro Yamane's Formula, resulting in a sample size of 400 respondents out of the total 178,504 female registered voters for the District Karak elections.

Taro Yamane's Formula (1973) is as follows: $n = \frac{N}{1 + Ne^2}$

Here, "n" is the sample size, "N" is the total population of the study, and "e" is the margin of error (0.05) with a confidence level of 95%.

Further, to achieve a reliable proportionate sampling figure, stratified sampling was employed. The proportional allocation method of sampling (Bowley, 1920) was utilized, where $n_1 = \frac{N_i}{N_1} \times n_i$, to select the number of respondents according to the sample size. The resulting proportionate sampling figures are presented in Table-1.

Table - 1: List of Female Registered Voters, Tehsil wise in Karak

Tehsil	The population of each council	Proportionate Formula	Proportionate
Karak	74765	74765/178504x400=168	n_1=168
Banda Daud Shah	42088	42088/178504x400=94	n_2=94
Takht–e- Nasrati	61651	61651/178504x400=138	n_3=138
Total			**400**

A proportionate sample of female registered voters was obtained using the formula: n=n1+n2+n3n=n1+n2+n3 n=168+94+138n=168+94+138 n=400n=400

The collected data underwent analysis using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) software. Descriptive statistics, including frequency and percentages, were employed to analyze the relationship among pertinent political and social variables such as marital status, occupation, age, and education concerning voting behavior. The measurement of voting behavior involved correlation T-Test.

Findings and Discussion

The following tables and discussion provides an analysis of the data gathered from female voters during field survey and interviews.

In following Table - 2, a total 33.3% of the respondents, totaling 133, fall into the age category of 18-30. Meanwhile, 33.5% (134 respondents) belong to the 31-45 age group, and 33.3% (133 respondents) are in the 46 and above category.

Table -2: Respondent Age

Age	Frequency	Percentages
18 up to 30	133	33.3
31 up to 45	134	33.5
45 up to above	133	33.3
Total	400	100.0

The following Table -3 indicates that 49.3% of the respondents, numbering 197, are employed, while 50.8% (203 respondents) are jobless.

Table -3: Respondent occupation

Job	Frequency	Percentages
on job	197	49.3
Jobless	203	50.8
Total	400	100.0

Table - 4: Respondent education

Education	Frequency	Percentages
Educated	196	49.0
Uneducated	204	51.0
Total	400	100.0

Table-4 shows 49% of the respondents (196) are educated, while 51% (204) are uneducated.

Table -5: Respondent Marital status

Marital status	Frequency	Percentages
Married	200	50.0
Unmarried	200	50.0
Total	400	100.0

The above Table-5 shows that 50% of the respondents (200) are married, and an equal percentage (50%) are unmarried.

Clientelism as a Voting Determinant in District Karak

Clientelism is one of the important determinants of voting behavior. People cast their vote on the basis of clientelism. So here five questions have been asked about clientelism. The responses are shown in the following Table – 6.

Table - 6

Item	Statement	A	SA	DA	SDA	N
•	Vote should be given on the basis of developmental works in your village	212 (53%)	133 (33.3%)	25 (6.3%)	11 (2.8%)	19 4.8%)
•	Vote should be	106	80	117	62	35

	given to a candidate who has strong economic background	(26.5 %)	(20.0 %)	(29.3 %)	(15.5 %)	(8.8 %)
•	Vote should be given to a candidate who makes agreement to do a lot for your family/village/constituency	179 (44.8 %)	97 (24.3 %)	80 (20.0 %)	29 (7.3 %)	15 (3.8 %)
•	Vote should be bargain.	29 (7.3 %)	20 (5.0 %)	95 (23.8 %)	226 (56.5 %)	30 (7.5 %)
•	Vote should be given to a party who economically support you (Benazir income support program).	150 (37.5 %)	95 (23.8 %)	80 (20.0 %)	47 11.8 %	28 (7.0 %)

Table-6 shows the details, so for Item 1, 86.3% of respondents agree that votes should be given based on developmental works, with 11.1% disagreeing and 4.8% neutral. Item 2 indicates that

46.5% agree that votes should go to a candidate with a strong economic background, while 44.8% disagree and 8.8% are neutral. For Item 3, 69.1% agree that votes should be given to a candidate making agreements for the community, with 27.3% disagreeing and 3.8% neutral. Item 4 shows that 12.3% agree that votes should be a bargain, 80.3% disagree, and 7.5% are neutral. Finally, Item 5 reveals that 61.3% agree that votes should be given to a party economically supporting voters, while 31.8% disagree, and 7.0% are neutral. In NA-34 District Karak during the 2018 General Elections, 55.05% of females cast their votes based on clientelism, with 38.6% disagreeing and 6.35% neutral.

Table -7: Relationship between Respondent Age and Clientelism

		Respondent Age	Clientelism
Respondent Age	Pearson Correlation	1	.016
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.753
	N	400	400
Clientelism	Pearson Correlation	.016	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.753	
	N	400	400

In this Table-7, Pearson correlation was used to explore the relationship between Respondent Age and Clientelism. The correlation coefficient (r = .016) with a p-value of .753 indicates a positive and insignificant relationship between Respondent Age and Clientelism.

Table -8: Relationship between Respondents occupation and Clientelism

		Respondents occupation	Clientelism
Respondent occupation	Pearson Correlation	1	.062
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.219
	N	400	400
Clientelism	Pearson Correlation	.062	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.219	
	N	400	400

In Table − 8, Pearson correlation was employed to assess the relationship between Respondents Occupation and Clientelism. The correlation coefficient (r = .062) with a p-value of .219 suggests a positive and significant relationship between Respondents Occupation and Clientelism.

Table -9: Relationship between Marital status and Clientelism

		Marital status	Clientelism
Marital status	Pearson Correlation	1	-.058
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.250
	N	400	400
Clientelism	Pearson Correlation	-.058	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.250	
	N	400	400

In Table-9, Pearson correlation was utilized to examine the relationship between Marital Status and Clientelism. The correlation coefficient (r = -.058) with a p-value of .250 indicates a negative and insignificant relationship between Marital Status and Clientelism.

Table -10: Relationship between respondent education and Clientelism

		respondent education	Clientelism
respondent education	Pearson Correlation	1	.061
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.221
	N	400	400
Clientelism	Pearson Correlation	.061	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.221	
	N	400	400

Table – 10 shows Pearson correlation was applied to explore the relationship between Respondent Education and Clientelism. The correlation coefficient (r = .061) with a p-value of .221 indicates a positive and insignificant relationship between Respondent Education and Clientelism.

Table – 11: Relationship between respondent Marital Status and Clientelism

Group Statistics (marital status with determinants)						
	Marital status	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	T	Sig
Clientelism	married	200	2.46	.636	1.151	.250
	unmarried	200	2.39	.683		

Table-11 reflects that an Independent sample T-test was employed to analyze the mean difference between marital status and clientelism. For clientelism, the mean of married respondents is 2.46 (.636), and for unmarried respondents, it is 2.39 (.683). The t-value is 1.151, and the significance value is .250, indicating an insignificant difference between married and unmarried respondents.

Table -12: Relationship between respondent Occupation and Clientelism

Group Statistics (occupation with determinant)						
	Respondent occupation	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	T	Sig
Clientelism	on job	197	2.38	.670	-1.231	.219

	Jobless	203	2.47	.650	-1.230	.219

Table – 12 shows that an Independent sample T-test was used to determine the mean difference between respondent occupation and clientelism. For clientelism, the mean of respondents on the job is 2.38 (.670), and for jobless respondents, it is 2.47 (.650). The t-value is -1.230, and the significance value is .219, indicating an insignificant difference between respondents on the job and jobless respondents.

Table -13: Relationship between respondent education and Clientelism

Group Statistics(respondent education with determinants)						
	respondent education	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	T	Sig
Clientelism	Educated	196	2.38	.672	.048	.221
	Uneducated	204	2.47	.649	.045	.221

Table – 13 shows Independent sample T-test was employed to analyze the mean difference between respondent education and

clientelism. For clientelism, the mean of educated respondents is 2.38 (.672), and for uneducated respondents, it is 2.47 (.649). The t-value is .048, and the significance value is .221, indicating an insignificant difference between educated and uneducated respondents.

Discussion and Interpretation

The following important findings have been derived from the data obtained.

• The majority of respondents, specifically 86.3%, agreed that votes should be cast based on developmental works in their village.

• A significant portion, 46.5% of the respondents, expressed agreement with the idea that votes should be given to candidates with a strong economic background.

• A substantial majority, 69.1% of the respondents, believed that votes should be given to candidates who make promises to contribute significantly to their family, village, or constituency.

• The data revealed that a considerable majority, 80.3% of the respondents, disagreed with the notion that votes should be subject to bargaining.

• Regarding party preference, a notable 61.3% of the respondents agreed that votes should be given to a party that economically supports them, as seen in the Benazir Income Support Program.

• Utilizing Pearson correlation, the analysis showed a positive and insignificant relationship between Respondent Age and Clientelism (r= .016, p-value= .753).

• Similar findings were observed for the relationship between Respondents Occupation and Clientelism, with a positive and insignificant correlation (r= .062, p-value= .219).

• The examination of the relationship between Respondents Education and Clientelism revealed a positive and insignificant correlation (r= .061, p-value= .221).

• An analysis of the relationship between Marital Status and Clientelism indicated a negative and insignificant correlation (r= -058, p-value= .250).

• In the context of clientelism, the mean for married respondents was 2.46 (.636), and for unmarried respondents, it was 2.39 (.683). The t-value for both married and unmarried respondents was 1.151, with a non-significant p-value of .250.

• For clientelism, the mean for respondents on the job was 2.38 (.670), and for jobless respondents, it was 2.47 (.650). The t-

value for both on the job and jobless respondents was -1.230, with an insignificant p-value of .219.

• In the realm of clientelism, the mean for educated respondents was 2.38 (.672), and for uneducated respondents, it was 2.47 (.649). The t-value for both educated and uneducated respondents was negligible (educated: .048, uneducated: .045), with an insignificant p-value of .221.

Conclusion

The findings reveal that women in District Karak played a pivotal role in shaping the electoral landscape by casting their votes based on clientelism, emphasizing its significance as a key voting determinant. Economic considerations, such as developmental work in their villages and the strong economic background of candidates, played a crucial role in shaping their voting preferences.

The support for the Pakistan People Party was notable, primarily attributed to the Benazir Income Support Program, which offered a glimmer of hope to economically distressed families. The perception of Imran Khan as a renowned and affluent figure also contributed to the party's support, with voters expecting substantial progress and prosperity. However, the disillusionment arose as many of Khan's promises remained unfulfilled.

Interestingly, factors such as age, marital status, occupation, and education were found to have no discernible impact on the voting behavior influenced by clientelism. The research connects these empirical findings with the theory of clientelism, highlighting its applicability in understanding the intricate nuances of female voting behavior in District Karak. The data supports the argument that clientelism is indeed applicable, accounting for 55.05% of the Female Voting Behavior in District Karak to some extent.

In essence, this study contributes valuable insights into the complex interplay of clientelism, socio-economic considerations, and political affiliations that shape the electoral choices of women in District Karak. The nuanced understanding of these dynamics provides a foundation for future electoral analyses and policymaking aimed at addressing the unique factors influencing voting behavior in this region.

References

Agbor, U, J. (2019). Religion as A Determinant of Voter Behavbiour: An Analysis Of The Relation Between Religious Inclination And Voting Pattern In Cross River State. Nigeria, *journal of social sciences Research*. Volume:14, pp.45-100

Al Mujahid, S. (1971). Pakistan: First General Elections. *Asian Survey*, Volume.11, pp.159-171.

Anderson, C, D and Stephenson, L, B. (2010). Voting Behaviour in Canada. University of British Columbia*, Publication of Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing,* Volume. 1, pp.193-326.

Avasthi, A. (1972). Local Government in India By Shriram Maheshwari. Orient Longman, Delhi. *India Quarterly: A Journal of International Affairs*, Volume.28, pp.167-167.

Baneerjee, A, C. (1978). The Constitutional History of India. *Macmillan Company of India ltd,* Volume. II, Meerut, pp. 81-99.

Bashir, U., and Khalid, P. D. I. (2020). Religion and Electoral Politics in Punjab: A Case Study of 2018 General Elections. *A Research Journal of South Asian Studies*, Volume. 34. pp. 7 – 24.

Bergson, A. (1958). Review of the Economic Theory of Democracy by Anthony Downs. *The American Economic Review*. Volume. 48, pp. 437-40.

Carmines, E, G. and Stimson, J, A. (1980). The Two Faces of Issue Voting. *The American Political Science Review*, Volume. 74, pp. 80-96.

Cho, S and Endersby, J, W. (2003). Issues, the Spatial Theory of Voting, and British General Elections: A Comparison of Proximity and Directional Models. *Public Choice*, Volume. 114, pp. 276-289.

Dodson, K. (2009). Review of The American Voter Revisited, by Michael S. Lewis-Beck, William G. Jacoby, Helmut Norpoth, and Herbert F. Weisberg, *Social Forces,* Volume. 88, pp.986-994.

Dorussen, H and Taylor, M. (2001). The Political Context of Issue-Priority Voting: Coalitions and Economic Voting in the Netherlands, 1970–1999. *Electoral Studies*, Volume. 20, pp.399–402.

Elock, H. (1977). Political Behavior. *Journal of Government and Opposition*, Volume. 12. pp.259-264.

Haider, K., & Ali, M. A. (2020). Cast and Baradri System and Voting Behavior in Pakistan (Elections 2018): A Case Study of Hafizabad District. *Pakistan Vision*, Volume. 21. pp.104-116.

Hazarak, B. (2015). Voting behaviour in India and its determinants. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, Volume.20, pp.22-25.

Hopkin, J. (2006). Conceptualizing political clientelism: Political exchange and democratic theory. In *APSA Annual Meeting, Philadelphia*, Volume.31, pp. 46-18).

Kanwal, L et all. (2016). Voting behaviour of educated youth in Pakistan: A study of Multan city. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, Volume.53, pp.2-10.

Khan, S., & Ahmad, I. (2017). Clientelism as a Determinant of Voting Behaviour: A Case Study of NA-11 Mardan. *Putaj Humanity and Social Sciences*, vol;24 p.1

Khan, S., and Ali, S. (2017). Religion as a Voting Determinant in the Electoral Politics of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: A Comparative Study of 2002, 2008 and 2013 General Elections. *Putaj Humanities & Social* Sciences, Volume.24. pp.1-20.

Lewis-Beck, M, S and Nadeau, R. (2011). Economic Voting Theory: Testing New Dimensions. *Electoral Studies*, Volume.30, pp. 288-94.

MacDonald, S, E et al. (1995). Political Sophistication and Models of Issue Voting. *British Journal of Political Science.* Volume. 25*,* pp. 345-354.

Maddens, B & Hajnal, I. (2001). Alternative Models of Issue Voting: The Case of the 1991 and 1995 Elections in Belgium. European Journal of Political *Research* Volume.39, pp.319-20.

Mansuri, G and Giné, X. (2018). Together We Will: Experimental Evidence on Female Voting Behavior in Pakistan. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics 2018,* Volume. 10. pp.207–235.

Muhammad, N et al. (2018). Political Determinants of Voting Behaviour in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *LASSIJ Liberal Arts and Social Sciences International Journal* Volume. 2, pp.1-10.

Muñoz, P. (2014). An informational theory of campaign clientelism: the case of Peru. *Comparative Politics*, Vol:47(1), p. 79-98.

Nawaz, A et al. (2020). Conundrum of Women Political Participation in Pakistan: Impediments and Opportunities. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*. Volume. 4, pp.135-149.

Nishizawa, Y. (2004). Economic Voting: Do institutions affect the way voters evaluate Incumbents? The Comparative Study of Electoral Systems, *Research Gate,* PP. 193-219.

Palfrey, T, R. & Poole, K, T. (1987). The Relationship between Information, Ideology, and Voting Behavior. *American Journal of Political Science*, Volume.31 pp.511-530.

Patrick Fournier et al. (2003). Issue Importance and Performance Voting. *Political Behaviour,* Volume. 25, pp.51-52.

Rabinowitz, G and Macdonald, S, E. (1989). A Directional Theory of Issue Voting. *The American Political Science Review*, Volume. 83, pp. 94-96.

Saud, M. (2020). Youth Participation in Political Activities: The art of Participation in Bhakkar. Punjab Pakistan. *Journal of Human Behavior in The Social Environment*, Volume.30, pp.760-777.

Singh, S, P. (2010). Contextual Influences on the Decision Calculus: A Cross-National Examination of Proximity Voting. *Electoral Studies*, Volume.29, pp. 427-431.

Weinschenk, A, C. (2010). Revisiting the Political Theory of Party Identification. *Political Behaviour*, Volume. 32, pp.273-275.

Wilder, A. R. (1996). Elections and political change in Pakistan: an analysis of Determinants of Voting Behavior in the Punjab, 1970-1993. Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy (Tufts University).

Zechmeister, E, J. (2008). Policy-Based Voting, Perceptions of Issue Space, and the 2000 Mexican Elections. *Electoral Studies*, Volume. 27, pp.649–50.